Reimagining the foundations of groundwater law in India: towards strengthening the climate change mitigation initiatives

Sujith Koonan

29-30 May 2015 SOAS

#### Context

- Current scenario
  - The most important source of freshwater
    - Fundamental right to water
  - Issues: depletion/water logging and contamination
- Groundwater and climate change
  - Dependability
  - Safety

### Concerns and questions

- How groundwater is governed in India?
- To what extent the legal framework is equipped to address climate change challenges?
  - Conservation and protection
  - Equity
  - Realisation of the fundamental right to water
- GW legal regime not informed by environmental law developments
  - E.g. PTD, PP
  - Not equipped to address both contemporary and future challenges

# GW: legal status

- Land owner's uncontrolled right to extract groundwater
  - Bucket approach
  - Plachimada Coca Cola case
  - Contrast: surface water under PTD (previously state control)
- Source: 19<sup>th</sup> century case laws from England
  - Acton v. Blundell (1843)]
  - A rule based on convenience and ignorance
  - A rule that can probably be justified only in time of plenty

## Common law rule's influence

- Indirect recognition under the Indian Easements Act, 1882
- Even if the extraction by a land owner adversely affects others, it is not legally actionable (*Kesava Bhatta v. Krishna Bhatta*, AIR 1946 Mad. 334)
- Applying the rule out of place, out of time
  - Kerala High Court in *Plachimada Coca Cola* case (2004)
- No focus on protection and conservation

# New groundwater laws

- Separate GW Act in many states
  - Kerala, Bihar, West Bengal etc.
- Based on Model Groundwater Bill, 2005
- No change in the nature of GW right
  - Land-based groundwater right remains intact
- Limited regulation
  - Permit/registration system
  - Centralised command and control approach

- Central level
  - CGWA
- Other mechanisms
  - District Collectors/sub-divisional magistrates (e.g. Rajasthan)
  - Low priority for revenue officials
- Conservation
  - Rainwater harvesting
  - Building regulations

# Implications

- GW law in India: unaffected by new knowledge and crisis! including CC
- Artificial distinction of GW and SW
- Common law rule
  - Outdated
  - Inequity in access and use (Plachimada)
  - Implications for the fundamental right to water
- New groundwater laws
  - Lack of focus on protection and conservation

### Towards a new groundwater law

- Abolition of land-based groundwater right
  - Common law rule is obsolete
- More focus on protection and conservation
  - aquifer based
  - Protection of recharge and discharge areas
- Get rid of the command and control approach
  - Decentralised mechanism

- Legal bases
  - Public trust doctrine
    - *Kesoram* case, Supreme Court, 2004
    - Plachimada Coca Cola case (pending)
  - Fundamental right to water
    - Existing legal regime leads to violation of FRW
  - Right to pollution free environment restriction of land rights
    - Bichhri case, Supreme Court of India, 1996
    - Thilakan case, Kerala High Court, 2007

#### Contd.

- Model Groundwater Bill, 2011
  - GW under public trust
  - Emphasis on protection and conservation
    - GW protection zones
  - Aquifer based approach
  - Decentralised institutional framework
    - Regulation, protection and conservation